

# Randomised controlled trial comparing the effectiveness of a web based journal club to a standard journal club format to teach critical appraisal skills

<b>Submission date</b> 11/01/2008	<b>Recruitment status</b> No longer recruiting	<input type="checkbox"/> Prospectively registered
		<input type="checkbox"/> Protocol
<b>Registration date</b> 13/02/2008	<b>Overall study status</b> Completed	<input type="checkbox"/> Statistical analysis plan
		<input type="checkbox"/> Results
<b>Last Edited</b> 08/08/2008	<b>Condition category</b> Not Applicable	<input type="checkbox"/> Individual participant data
		<input type="checkbox"/> Record updated in last year

## Plain English Summary

Not provided at time of registration

## Contact information

### Type(s)

Scientific

### Contact name

Dr Robin McLeod

### Contact details

Mount Sinai Hospital  
449 - 600 University Ave.  
Toronto, Ontario  
Canada  
M5X 1G5  
+1 416 586 4800 ext. 8534  
rmcleod@mtsinai.on.ca

## Additional identifiers

EudraCT/CTIS number

IRAS number

ClinicalTrials.gov number

## Secondary identifying numbers

07-59

# Study information

## Scientific Title

### Study hypothesis

There is no rigorous study comparing the value of electronic teaching of critical appraisal skills to that of a conventional standard journal club format. We hypothesise that web based learning is as effective as a standard journal club format in teaching critical appraisal skills.

### Ethics approval required

Old ethics approval format

### Ethics approval(s)

Ethics approval received from Mount Sinai Hospital Research Ethics Board on 3rd August 2007 (ref: 07-0171-E).

### Study design

Multicentre randomised controlled trial. Programs randomly allocated by cluster randomisation to control or intervention group. Residents within the program will receive the same method of teaching.

### Primary study design

Interventional

### Secondary study design

Randomised controlled trial

### Study setting(s)

Hospital

### Study type(s)

Diagnostic

## Participant information sheet

### Condition

Teaching critical appraisal skills through web-based learning

### Interventions

Please note that, as of 20/06/2008, the anticipated end date of this ISRCTN record has been updated from 31/12/2008 to 30/06/2009.

Baseline data will be collected on the programs as well as the residents. The information will include the following:

1. Program:

1.1. Type of journal club currently in existence

- 1.2. Number of residents in the program
  - 1.3. Current education intervention for teaching critical appraisal skills
  - 1.4. Faculty with clinical epidemiology or health services research training and performing related research
  - 1.5. Information related to format and faculty who will be involved in the standard journal club format (if randomised to this group)
  - 1.6. List of all residents and their email addresses who will be participating in the trial
2. Residents:
- 2.1. Year of training
  - 2.2. Previous training in clinical epidemiology
  - 2.3. Previous exposure to critical appraisal teaching

General Surgery Programs will be randomised to either the web based group or the standard journal club group:

**Web Based Group:**

1. All residents in the program will receive EBRS packages through the internet only. No other critical appraisal journal club will be held
2. All participating residents will be registered with EBRS
3. The residents will be provided with instructions on how to access the EBRS website and will be able to download all articles and reviews from the site
4. A listserv discussion group will be set up for the residents in this group which will be facilitated by methodological and clinical experts
5. Each month the resident will receive email notification that the articles are available for reading
6. A clinical scenario will be posted on the listserv to start the discussion
7. At the end of the first week of the 2 week discussion, the clinical and methodological reviews will be posted
8. At the completion of the 2 week discussion, residents will have 2 weeks to complete an online monthly evaluation form

**Standard Journal Club Group:**

1. All residents in the program will receive EBRS teaching in the standard journal club format. No other journal club will be held
2. Eight EBRS packages including all articles and reviews will be sent to the programs
3. Programs will be asked to set up a monthly journal club led by the general surgical staff.
4. Residents will be expected to have read the articles prior to each journal club and be prepared to discuss the articles in a seminar situation with prompts by the faculty member. They will receive the clinical and methodological reviews at the end of each journal club.
5. The residents will complete an evaluation at the end of each journal club and they will be returned to the administrative centre

**Intervention Type**

Other

**Phase**

Not Specified

**Primary outcome measure**

All participating residents will complete a critical appraisal test within one month of completion of the EBRS packages. The critical appraisal test is a validated tool developed by the University

of Toronto. The test will be administered by the individual general surgery programs in a 3-hour time slot in a designated examination room. The tests will be sent to the administrative centre at Mount Sinai Hospital and will be corrected by two of the investigators using a standardised exam key.

### **Secondary outcome measures**

1. Mean number of packages which each group completes
2. All residents will be asked to complete a survey which will assess the convenience, interest, relevance and educational value of EBRS and the format it is given in

### **Overall study start date**

01/10/2007

### **Overall study end date**

30/06/2009

## **Eligibility**

### **Participant inclusion criteria**

1. The general surgery program has an organised journal club in existence but is not currently using Evidence Based Reviews in Surgery (EBRS) packages
2. The program is willing and has the commitment to be randomised to either a web based or standard journal club format
3. The program has an administrative assistant who can liaise with the trial coordinator
4. Within the program, there are at least 10 residents who are agreeable to participating in the trial

### **Participant type(s)**

Patient

### **Age group**

Adult

### **Sex**

Both

### **Target number of participants**

200

### **Participant exclusion criteria**

Currently or previously using EBRS packages.

### **Recruitment start date**

01/10/2007

### **Recruitment end date**

30/06/2009

## **Locations**

## **Countries of recruitment**

Canada

United States of America

## **Study participating centre**

**Mount Sinai Hospital**

Toronto, Ontario

Canada

M5X 1G5

## **Sponsor information**

### **Organisation**

Physician's Services Incorporated (PSI) Foundation (Canada)

### **Sponsor details**

1006 - 5160 Yonge Street

Toronto, Ontario

Canada

M2N 6L9

+1 416 226 6323

psif@psifoundation.org

### **Sponsor type**

Research organisation

### **Website**

<http://www.psifoundtaion.org>

### **ROR**

<https://ror.org/0385yzn06>

## **Funder(s)**

### **Funder type**

Research organisation

### **Funder Name**

Physician's Services Incorporated (PSI) Foundation (Canada) (ref: 07-59)

# Results and Publications

## Publication and dissemination plan

Not provided at time of registration

## Intention to publish date

## Individual participant data (IPD) sharing plan

## IPD sharing plan summary

Not provided at time of registration