

# The effect of fines on non-attendance in public hospital outpatient clinics

<b>Submission date</b> 22/06/2015	<b>Recruitment status</b> No longer recruiting	<input type="checkbox"/> Prospectively registered <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Protocol
<b>Registration date</b> 06/07/2015	<b>Overall study status</b> Completed	<input type="checkbox"/> Statistical analysis plan <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Results
<b>Last Edited</b> 19/02/2021	<b>Condition category</b> Other	<input type="checkbox"/> Individual participant data

## Plain English summary of protocol

### Background and study aims

Non-attendance at scheduled appointments in public hospitals is a challenge to the best use of healthcare resources, which could ultimately affect patient health due to longer waiting times. It has been estimated that 7% of all scheduled outpatient appointments in the United Kingdom are not kept by patients. Different reminder systems have been shown to have a moderate effect on reducing the number of patient no-shows whereas the effect of fining people who do not show up for their appointment has not yet been tested in a clinical trial. Such use of financial incentives could however impact access to care differently across different socioeconomic groups (horizontal inequality). The aim of this study is to assess the effect of fines on hospital outpatient non-attendance.

### Who can participate?

Patients that have made an appointment at the participating outpatient clinic.

### What does the study involve?

All appointments made at the outpatient clinic are randomly assigned to one of two groups; an intervention group and a control group. Appointments assigned to the intervention group includes an attachment to the appointment letter explaining that a fine will be issued in case of non-attendance without giving notice. Appointments assigned the control arm follow usual practice (same system but no letter attachment). The study then compares the number of appointments for which the patients did not show up in each group, along with other analysis.

### What are the possible benefits and risks of participating?

Not provided at time of registration

### Where is the study run from?

The Department of Orthopaedic Surgery at Viborg Regional Hospital (Denmark)

### When is the study starting and how long is it expected to run for?

March 2014 to June 2017

Who is funding the study?

The Danish Regions, Central Denmark Region and the Ministry of Health and Prevention (Denmark)

Who is the main contact?

1. Ms Emely Ek Blæhr

emebla@rm.dk

2. Dr Ulla Væggemose

Ulla.Vaeggemose@stab.rm.dk

## Contact information

### Type(s)

Scientific

### Contact name

Ms Emely Ek Blæhr

### Contact details

CFK Public Health and Quality

Region House Aarhus

Olof Palmes Allé 15

Aarhus N

Denmark

8200

+45 7841 4370

emebla@rm.dk

### Type(s)

Scientific

### Contact name

Dr Ulla Væggemose

### Contact details

CFK Public Health and Quality

Region House Aarhus

Olof Palmes Allé 15

Aarhus N

Denmark

8200

+45 7841 4360

Ulla.Vaeggemose@stab.rm.dk

## Additional identifiers

EudraCT/CTIS number

IRAS number

**ClinicalTrials.gov number**

**Secondary identifying numbers**

N/A

## **Study information**

### **Scientific Title**

The effect of fines on non-attendance in public hospital outpatient clinics: a pragmatic, randomised controlled trial

### **Study objectives**

In Denmark, introduction of fines for non-attendance in hospital outpatient clinics have been debated over years. Already in 2005, a collaborative agreement between the Danish Regions and the Danish Medical Association opened the opportunity for privately practicing specialists to issue fines for non attendance of DKK 250 for consultations and DKK 500 for surgical procedures. The expected benefits were overall related to better use of resources whereas concerns were expressed about a detrimental effect on horizontal equity due to that fines could have the greatest impact on the most vulnerable individuals. Moreover, the use of fines was seen as a break with the fundamental value of free and equal access to health care as well as a potential threat to the patient-health professional relationship, which should ideally be independent of financial interests. Despite the fact that 10 years have passed since the regulatory context opened for use of fines in the Danish health care system for privately practicing specialists, no systematic evidence on the resulting practice, the efficacy or the effect appears to have been reported. It has therefore been decided by the Danish Regions that the effect of using fines to moderate non-attendance at somatic, hospital-based outpatient clinics in Denmark should be scientifically investigated. This trial is a result of that decision. In accordance, the objective is to investigate the effect of fines on hospital outpatient non-attendance with respect to attendance and efficiency as well as horizontal inequality.

### **Ethics approval required**

Old ethics approval format

### **Ethics approval(s)**

The Ministry of Health and Prevention in Denmark, 28/11/2014, ref: 303/2014

### **Study design**

Single-centre randomised controlled trial

### **Primary study design**

Interventional

### **Secondary study design**

Randomised controlled trial

### **Study setting(s)**

Hospital

### **Study type(s)**

Other

## **Participant information sheet**

Not available in web format, please use contact details to request a participant information sheet

## **Health condition(s) or problem(s) studied**

The effect of fines on hospital outpatient non-attendance with respect to attendance and efficiency as well as horizontal inequality.

## **Interventions**

All appointments will be made in accordance with usual practice except for two facts. First, the appointment letter will inform the individual (both intervention and control arms) about the trial. It is explained that the investigation has been initiated by the Danish Regions and approved by the Ministry of Health and that their appointment has been randomly assigned to be subject to a fine, in case of non-attendance without notice, if the appointment letter is attached to letter about the fine system. Second, for appointments randomised to the intervention group only, the letter specifying the conditions is attached to the appointment letter. In this letter it is made clear that a fine will be issued in case of non-attendance without giving notice, at any time, before the time of the appointment. It is also informed that the fine amounts to DKK 250 and that it will be issued by a central office under the local government administration (Corporate Finance, Central Denmark Region), which is open for e-mails and telephone calls during normal office hours in case of questions or complaints.

## **Intervention Type**

Behavioural

## **Primary outcome measure**

Proportion of appointments who are attended: All types of appointments are registered in the clinic by the secretariat on a daily basis. All parameters except for sociodemographics are automatically extracted from the electronic patient journal system into a trial registry administrative registered in electronic trial registries. Sociodemographics are extracted from various, individual-level national registries administered by Statistics Denmark.

## **Secondary outcome measures**

1. Proportions of appointments cancelled by the department
2. Proportion of appointments cancelled by the individual
3. Case-mix of individuals in terms of sociodemographics such as age, sex, income, education, distance to hospital, travel time and waiting times and in terms of health problem characteristics such as anatomy, type of appointment and treatment costs will be used as a secondary outcome

All types of appointments are registered in the clinic by the secretariat on a daily basis. All parameters except for sociodemographics are automatically extracted from the electronic patient journal system into a trial registry administrative registered in electronic trial registries. Sociodemographics are extracted from various, individual-level national registries administered by Statistics Denmark.

## **Overall study start date**

18/03/2014

## **Completion date**

30/06/2017

# Eligibility

## Key inclusion criteria

Inclusion criteria as of 28/06/2016:

1. Consecutive appointments for individuals scheduled for diagnostics, treatment or follow up in the outpatient clinic
2. Appointments for individuals who are booked via an appointment letter sent between 01/05/2015 and 01/12/2015

Original inclusion criteria:

1. Consecutive appointments for individuals scheduled for diagnostics, treatment or follow up in the outpatient clinic
2. Appointments for individuals who are booked via an appointment letter sent between 01/05/2015 and 30/04/2016

## Participant type(s)

All

## Age group

All

## Sex

Both

## Target number of participants

Around 6,500 appointments (based on department statistics).

## Total final enrolment

6746

## Key exclusion criteria

Exclusion criteria as of 28/06/2016:

1. As a user may have more than one appointment, only the first appointment during the period was considered
2. Appointments for individuals who are booked without an appointment letter, e.g. via telephone or face-to-face
3. Appointments for individuals receiving physiotherapy or occupational therapy in the outpatient clinic (typically in a group-based setup also without appointment letters)
4. Appointments for individuals with residence in Greenland (requiring an overseas flight)

Original exclusion criteria:

1. Appointments for individuals who are booked without an appointment letter, e.g. via telephone or face-to-face
2. Appointments for individuals receiving physiotherapy or occupational therapy in the outpatient clinic (typically in a group-based setup also without appointment letters)
3. Appointments for individuals with residence in Greenland (requiring an overseas flight)

## Date of first enrolment

01/05/2015

**Date of final enrolment**

01/12/2015

## **Locations**

**Countries of recruitment**

Denmark

**Study participating centre**

**The Department of Orthopaedic Surgery at Viborg Regional Hospital**

Viborg Regional Hospital

Heibergs Allé 4

8800 Viborg

Viborg

Denmark

8800

## **Sponsor information**

**Organisation**

DEFACTUM – Public Health & Health Services Research

**Sponsor details**

Olof Palmes Allé 15

Aarhus N

Denmark

8200

+45 (0)7841 4360

cfk@rm.dk

**Sponsor type**

Research organisation

**Website**

<http://www.cfk.rm.dk/>

## **Funder(s)**

**Funder type**

Government

**Funder Name**

Danish Regions

**Funder Name**

The Ministry of Health and Prevention (Denmark)

**Funder Name**

Central Denmark Region

## Results and Publications

**Publication and dissemination plan**

All results from the trial will be published in the end of 2016 or beginning of 2017.

**Intention to publish date**

01/01/2017

**Individual participant data (IPD) sharing plan**

**IPD sharing plan summary**

Not expected to be made available

**Study outputs**

Output type	Details	Date created	Date added	Peer reviewed?	Patient-facing?
<a href="#">Protocol article</a>	protocol	13/06/2016		Yes	No
<a href="#">Results article</a>	results	13/04/2018	19/02/2021	Yes	No